

ATTACHMENT D

Award Date	File #	Project Name	Award Amount	Awarded Vendor	Trade Agreements	Number of Submissions	Evaluation Criteria	Sustainable Procurement Valuation
2021 May 25	2839	Nanaimo Ice Centre - Interior Lighting Renewal	\$ 96,505.92	Houle Electric Ltd.	NWPTA CFTA	9	<p>Sustainable specifications were defined and required to be met by all Bidders:</p> <p>PACKAGING</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contractor will ensure the fixtures are packaged appropriately with no use any foam materials in packaging or excessive use of plastic packaging materials. Contractor will ensure packaging materials can be recycled within the City of Nanaimo's recycling streams. Contractor will ensure all packaging materials are appropriately recycled/disposed of in the proper waste streams and ensure proper off-site recycling. Contractor will ensure, while upholding safety and integrity of the product, use environmentally preferable packaging materials made from recycled material content, and/or made from renewable or biodegradable materials such as wood, paper or other. <p>END-OF-LIFE MANAGEMENT FOR OLD LIGHTING PRODUCTS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contractor will adhere to any Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR) regulations and/or Provincial regulations/standards for proper separation and recycling of the old lighting products and associated fixtures and metals to ensure no materials are sent to landfill. Recycling locations and other information can be found here: https://www.productcare.org/products/lights/. Contractor will provide documentation to demonstrate compliance and proof of proper recycling processes followed for the project upon completion before final payment is issued. <p>DISCLOSURE OF CONFLICT MINERALS & HAZARDOUS SUBSTANCES</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contractor shall provide a list of any conflict minerals and/or hazardous substances contained in the lighting being provided. This is for disclosure and transparency only. 	All Bidders by submitting agreed to the Sustainable specifications.
2021 Sep 29	2826	Fire Station #1 Office Furniture	\$ 150,585.49	Graphic Office Interiors Ltd	NWPTA CFTA	3	<p>Desired and Weighted Criteria was used:</p> <p>Technical Specifications 15 Delivery, Installation and Storage 15 Warranty 10 Price 40 Sustainability 20</p> <p>a. Provide evidence that the Goods to be purchased are BIFMA and ANSI certified. b. Indicate the Eco-labels for each of the furniture lines. c. Describe any other elements of the furniture manufacture process, the materials used, the delivery, and/or installation that highlight the sustainable function or features. d. Describe your process to minimize packaging environmental impacts associated with packaging, such as blanket/no-wrap outbound packaging, returnable cartons and other forms of reusable packaging.</p>	<p>All three Proponents addressed the requirements in their proposals. Notes from the evaluation team:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All furniture is manufactured in factories that are certified with ISO 14001. It is very difficult to evaluate the sustainability section of the procurement package as there is so much information to vet. It can be difficult to determine if the claims the vendor makes are true, and even if the certification we are asking for is worthwhile. The sustainable worksheet was helpful and gets you thinking about sustainability issues, however did take some research and time to complete as this area was foreign to me and took some learning. Needed some assistance to move forward to the requirements for the RFP and coming up with desired eco labels & certifications. One of the outcomes from this process was to remove the day room table from the procurement package and single source it from a local vendor with locally sourced materials (under NWPTA threshold).
2022 Jan 24	3038	Pest Control Services	\$17,275.00	Abell Pest Control Inc.	NWPTA CFTA	4	<p>Desired and Weighted Criteria was used:</p> <p>Company Profile, Team Qualifications, and Relevant Experience 25 Project Understanding and Work Schedule 25 Customer Service and Reporting 15 Price 25 Sustainability 10</p> <p>a. Nanaimo aims to reduce toxins and hazardous substances where possible, to safeguard employee, community and ecosystem health. Tell us what steps you have taken to reduce toxic and hazardous substances in your Pest Control Services. b. Describe the systems, policies and/or practices you use to manage and reduce harmful gaseous emissions (e.g. VOCs, SOx, NOx, other air pollutants, toxic fumes); harmful solid emissions (e.g. scarce metals, use of hazardous pesticides, particulate matter); and harmful liquid emissions (e.g. spills, liquid toxic waste, chemical fluids).</p>	<p>Identified as a HIPO</p> <p>All four Proponents addressed the requirements in their proposals. Prior to this opportunity the City relied on several single source contracts that were not coordinated. Having one contract, with one Vendor managing all City facilities, with a coordinated approach, should result in a reduction in GHG emissions.</p>
2022 Feb 17	3044	Mid-Town Water Supply Main Upgrade Construction	\$ 35,644,849.00	Knappett Industries (2006) Ltd	NWPTA CFTA	3	<p>Desired and Weighted Criteria was used:</p> <p>Experience and Qualifications 30 Project Plan 25 Price 20 Risk Mitigation, Innovation, and Sustainability 25</p> <p>Proponents are advised the City has recently adopted a Sustainable Procurement Policy that serves to advance a range of environmental, social and ethical strategic plan objectives.</p> <p>i. Describe how the project could be used to advance the City's Sustainability Priorities. Environmental Priorities such as Climate Action, Zero Waste, Pollution Prevention; Social Priorities such as Diversity, Local Employment, Inclusion; and Ethical Priorities such as Fair Compensation, Labour Standards, and Health and Safety; ii. Describe how the Proponent would give prime consideration to protecting the environment during all stages of construction and how these could be factored into the design; iii. List any environmentally sensitive products or services that could be integrated into the project and list any conflict materials and hazard substances the City should look to avoid to mitigate adverse effects on the environment; iv. Describe how the Proponent will contribute to local employment; and v. Highlight other sustainability features for City consideration that could be built into the project and ensure a sustainably viable project.</p>	Proponents were unresponsive to the criteria, having sustainability imbedded in a criteria makes it difficult to evaluate the results.

City of Nanaimo

Summary of RFX Documents - Sustainable Procurement
July 1, 2021 to June 30, 2022

Award Date	File #	Project Name	Award Amount	Awarded Vendor	Trade Agreements	Number of Submissions	Evaluation Criteria	Sustainable Procurement Valuation
2022 Mar 31	3043	Watering Services and Maintenance	\$ 99,400.00	Lone Pine Horticulture	NWPTA CFTA	2	Desired and Weighted Criteria was used: Company Profile, Supervisor Qualifications, and Relevant Experience 25 Project Understanding, and Equipment List 30 Pricing 40 Equity, Inclusion and Diversity 5 Nanaimo is committed to a diverse, inclusive, and socially just society. Tell us how the product/ service you are providing to our organization contributes to community social benefit. Consider benefits for equity-seeking groups, such as: Indigenous people, women, youth, persons with disabilities, or previously incarcerated persons. Describe the policies and/ or practices your organization has in place to promote diversity and inclusion in your workplace, including efforts to diversify your workforce with respect to representation of equity seeking groups. Vendor can provide a copy of relevant policies for Inclusive Hiring and or Diversity and Inclusion.	Both Proponents were responsive to criteria.
2022 Apr 4	3027	Voting Machines (Ballot Tabulators), Accessories & Support Services	\$121,995.00	The Dominion Voting Systems Corporation	NWPTA CFTA	2	Desired and Weighted Criteria was used: Proponent and Personnel Experience and Qualifications 15 Technical Requirements 20 Approach and Implementation 20 Support Services 20 Training Program 10 Price 10 Sustainability 5 The Proposal content for this Evaluation Criteria should include, but not be limited to the following: .1 Describe your process to minimize packaging, environmental impacts associated with packaging, such as blanket/no-wrap outbound packaging, returnable cartons and other forms of reusable packaging. .2 Describe how Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Emissions related to the Service or Proponent practices are reduced, in order to mitigate climate change. .3 Describe your end of life management of Voting Machines (Ballot Tabulators). .4 Describe your eco-friendly printing methods for ballot printing (i.e. printed on FSC certified paper, etc.). .5 Describe if your ballot boxes are reused or the process for recycling. .6 Describe any environmental friendly transportation process.	Both Proponents were responsive to criteria.
2022 May 11	3059	Fleet Insurance Brokerage Services	Compensated through ICBC commission	Westland Insurance Group Ltd.	NWPTA CFTA	4	Desired and Weighted Criteria was used: Experience and Qualifications 25 Approach and Methodology 35 Availability and Response Time 30 Sustainability 10 .1 Provide details how the Proponent will take to minimize adverse impact to the environment during the provision of the Services outlined in this RFP. .2 Provide details of the steps the Proponent would take to minimize greenhouse gas emissions during the provision of the Services outlined in this RFP.	Only two of the four Proponents provided adequate detail under the Sustainability criteria. The Westland proposal detailed their green and advanced environmental commitment initiatives.
2022 May 16	3071	Brechin Dock Replacement	\$ 188,960.00	Poralu Marine	NWPTA CFTA	3	Desired and Weighted Criteria was used: Product Detail 30 Company Information, Project Examples, Project Understanding 25 Warranty 10 Price 30 Workforce Development 5 1. Please tell us about employment training, skills training, career mentoring, and / or apprenticeship opportunities you can provide within the provision of the service you are offering for Nanaimo. Provide information on the number or % of individuals who will participate in workforce development opportunities and explain how this will be reported to the City once the work is complete.	Two of the three Proponents were unresponsive to the criteria.

City of Nanaimo

Summary of RfX Documents - Sustainable Procurement
July 1, 2021 to June 30, 2022

Award Date	File #	Project Name	Award Amount	Awarded Vendor	Trade Agreements	Number of Submissions	Evaluation Criteria	Sustainable Procurement Valuation
2022 May 22	3035	Nanaimo Aquatic Centre Phase 2 & Bowen Park Complex Lighting	\$ 145,776.40	Mazzei Electric Ltd.	NWPTA CFTA	5	Sustainable specifications were defined and required to be met by all Bidders: Bidders are advised the City has recently adopted a Sustainable Procurement Policy that serves to advance a range of environmental, social and ethical strategic plan objectives. Bidders, having read and understood all documents related to this Request for Bid confirm the following: a. Packaging i. Contractor will ensure the fixtures are packaged appropriately with no use any foam materials in packaging or excessive use of plastic packaging materials. ii. Contractor will ensure packaging materials can be recycled within the City of Nanaimo's recycling streams. iii. Contractor will ensure all packaging materials are appropriately recycled/disposed of in the proper waste streams and ensure proper off-site recycling. iv. Contractor will ensure, while upholding safety and integrity of the product, use environmentally preferable packaging materials made from recycled material content, and/or made from renewable or biodegradable materials such as wood, paper or other. b. End-of-Life Management for Old Lighting Products i. Contractor will adhere to any Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR) regulations and/or Provincial regulations/standards at https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/environment/waste-management/recycling/extended-producer-responsibility/recycling-regulation for proper separation and recycling of the old lighting products and associated fixtures and metals to ensure no materials are sent to landfill. Recycling locations and other information can be found at https://www.productcare.org/products/lights/?utm_campaign=efc ii. Contractor will provide documentation to demonstrate compliance and proof of proper recycling processes followed for the project upon completion before final payment is issued. c. Disclosure of Conflict Minerals & Hazardous Substances Contractor shall provide a list of any conflict minerals found at https://ecovadis.com/glossary/conflict-minerals/ and/or hazardous substances contained in the lighting being provided. This is for disclosure and transparency only.	All Bidders by submitting agreed to the Sustainable specifications.
2022 Jun 15	3094	Microsoft Enterprise Agreement & Licencing Solution Provider	\$ 659,985.85	Long View Systems Corporation	NWPTA CFTA	4	Desired and Weighted Criteria was used: Experience 20 Methodology, Approach and Support Services 35 Training 15 Price 20 Sustainability 10 Describe all initiatives, policies and programs that illustrate your firm's efforts toward sustainable practices and environment responsibility in providing the services that would benefit the City.	All four Proponents addressed the requirements in their proposals. Notes from the evaluation team: The response to Sustainability was generic. If we are applying Sustainability to a software or licensing provider, it would be based upon the corporate stance and not the products delivered.
2022 Jun 21	3110	Traffic and Street Light Maintenance	\$ 150,000.00	Daeco Installations	NWPTA CFTA	3	Desired and Weighted Criteria was used: Company Profile, Team Qualifications, and Relevant Experience 20 Project Understanding and Capacity 15 Vehicles and Equipment 10 Price 50 Social Priorities - Workforce Development 5 a. Provide information on employment training, skills training, career mentoring, and / or apprenticeship opportunities you can provide within the provision of the services you are offering to the City. b. Provide the number or percentage (%) of individuals who will participate in workforce development opportunities. c. Explain how the workforce development opportunities will be implemented and monitored throughout the duration of the contract. Explain how this information will be reported to the City at a minimum once per year.	Proponents outlined the training and employment opportunities within their companies.
2022 Jun 29	3049	Rink Board Advertising	Revenue Contract	Visual Sports Image of Canada Ltd	NWPTA CFTA	3	Desired and Weighted Criteria was used: Contractor Profile and Experience 30 Specifications 30 Value Added 5 Proposed Revenue 30 Workforce Development 5 a. The proponent must provide information on the number or % of individuals who will participate in workforce development opportunities. Please tell us about any employment training, skills training, career mentoring, and/or apprenticeship opportunities you provide within your company.	Proponents were unresponsive to the criteria.
2022 Jul 5	3161	Pavement Condition Assessment	\$117,400.00	Stantec Consulting Ltd.	NWPTA CFTA	2	Desired and Weighted Criteria was used: Company Profile and Experience, Team Qualifications and Subcontractors 45 Equipment, Schedule and Optional Items 20 Pricing 30 Sustainability – Workforce Development 5 a. Please tell us about employment training, skills training, career mentoring, and / or apprenticeship opportunities you can provide within the provision of the service you are offering for the City of Nanaimo. b. Provide information on the number or % of individuals who will participate in the above mentioned workforce development opportunities and explain how this will be reported to the City once the work is complete.	Both Proponents were responsive to criteria.

City of Nanaimo

Summary of RFX Documents - Sustainable Procurement
July 1, 2021 to June 30, 2022

Award Date	File #	Project Name	Award Amount	Awarded Vendor	Trade Agreements	Number of Submissions	Evaluation Criteria	Sustainable Procurement Valuation
2022 Jul 11	3112	Midtown Gateway Phase 2A Final Ground Improvements and Utilities	\$10,100,000.00	Knappett Industries (2006) Ltd.	NWPTA CFTA	3	<p>Desired and Weighted Criteria was used: Experience and Qualifications 30 Project Plan 20 Price 30 Risk Mitigation and Innovation 10 Sustainability 10</p> <p>Proponents are advised the City has recently adopted a Sustainable Procurement Policy that serves to advance a range of environmental, social and ethical strategic plan objectives. The City of Nanaimo's Sustainable Procurement Policy can be viewed here: Sustainable Procurement Policy</p> <p>(a) Describe how the project could be used to advance the City's Sustainability Priorities. Environmental Priorities such as Climate Action, Zero Waste, Pollution Prevention; Social Priorities such as Diversity, Local Employment, Inclusion; and Ethical Priorities such as Fair Compensation, Labour Standards, and Health and Safety.</p> <p>(b) Describe how the Proponent would give prime consideration to protecting the environment during all stages of construction and how these could be factored into the design.</p> <p>(c) List any environmentally sensitive products or services that could be integrated into the project and list any conflict materials and hazard substances the City should look to avoid to mitigate adverse effects on the environment.</p> <p>(d) Describe how the Proponent will contribute to local employment and how these results will be reported to the City.</p> <p>(e) Highlight other sustainability features for City consideration that could be built into the project to ensure a sustainably viable project.</p>	All three Proponents were responsive to criteria.
2022 Jul 22	3098	Electrical Maintenance and Repair Services	\$ 1,500,000.00	Shaw Electrical Services Ltd.	NWPTA CFTA	5	<p>Desired and Weighted Criteria was used: Company Profile, Team Qualifications, and Relevant Experience 30 Project Understanding, Capacity and Specialized Services 20 Price 40 Safety Training, Warranties and Indigenous Reconciliation 10</p> <p>a. Provide information on the Proponent's in house or contracted safety training program. Include a high level overview of subjects covered and the Proponent's policies concerning refresher and ongoing training requirements.</p> <p>b. State the warranty term and summary of what is covered in relation to Contractor supplied services, Sub-Contractor supplied services, Contractor supplied materials and any additional warranties offered.</p> <p>c. Describe systems, policies or practices you will use to engage with indigenous persons to provide socio-economic opportunities such as subcontracting, employment, or skills training.</p> <p>The City requires information on this initiative and whether the engagement has been successful or not. Please explain how the Proponent intends to report the results to the City, successful or not. For example, reporting information may include the number or percentage (%) of individuals engaged to participate and the number or percentage (%) of individuals who gained an opportunity.</p>	Proponents were somewhat responsive to the criteria however having it imbedded in with other elements did not highlight the importance.
2022 Jul 22	3118	Maffeo Sutton Playground - Phase 2	\$ 293,481.00	Kohlar Enterprises Ltd.	NWPTA CFTA	1	<p>Desired and Weighted Criteria was used: Proponent – Overview and Relevant Experience 15 Experience and Qualifications of Personnel 25 Methodology and Schedule (Consists of Part A & Part B) 20 Price 30 Sustainability 10</p> <p>Proponents are advised the City has recently adopted a Sustainable Procurement Policy that serves to advance a range of environmental, social and ethical strategic plan objective.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Describe your process for disposal of existing play equipment. Example: recycle, reuse, etc. Describe your process for disposing packaging, waste materials. Describe how the Proponent reduces emissions, Greenhouse Gases. Describe how the Proponent will contribute to local employment. Highlight other sustainability features offered by the Proponent. 	The single Proponent was responsive to criteria.
In-Progress Opportunites								
	3089	Nanaimo BMX Track Construction						
	3093	Printed Business Cards, Envelopes, Forms, Letterhead, Note Pads, Tax Brochures Part 1 of 2						Identified as a HIPO
	3167	Fire Extinguishers, Suppression, Alarms, Emergency Lighting & Sprinkler Systems Maintenance						
	3192	Vancouver Island Conference Centre (VICC) Venue Management						
	3193	Mobile Wireless and Data Services (Cellular Phones)						

City of Nanaimo

Summary of RFX Documents - Sustainable Procurement
 July 1, 2021 to June 30, 2022

Award Date	File #	Project Name	Award Amount	Awarded Vendor	Trade Agreements	Number of Submissions	Evaluation Criteria	Sustainable Procurement Valuation
Upcoming Opportunities								
	3078	On Call Painting Services, as and when required						
	3095	Biomedical Pickup Services Services						
	3172	Printing RFP Part 2 of 2						
	3173	Graffiti Removal						