



MINUTES

**NANAIMO COMMUNITY HERITAGE COMMISSION (NCHC)
HELD ON WEDNESDAY, 2013-SEP-04 AT 5:00 PM
BOARD ROOM, SERVICE & RESOURCE CENTRE (411 DUNSMUIR STREET)**

Members Present:	Diane Brennan, Chair Bill Gard Kerrie Low Christine Meutzner	Jill Stannard John Hofman Loyd Sherry
Members Absent:	Geraldine Manson	Charlene Riches John Manning
Staff Present:	Chris Sholberg, Heritage Planner	Rebecca Tubbs, Recording Secretary

1. Call to Order

Chair D. Brennan called the meeting to order at 5:04 pm.

2. Approval of Agenda & Late Items

The agenda was approved as presented.

3. Adoption of Minutes (2013-JUN-19)

It was moved and seconded that the Minutes from 2013-JUN-19 be adopted as presented. The motion was carried.

4. Budget Review

5. Correspondence, Periodicals, & Newsletters

None.

6. New Business

a) Harmac Arboretum (1200 Maughan Road) – For Information

For information. C. Sholberg provided information on the Harmac Arboretum as information prior to the meeting. The arboretum is owned by the RDN but is located within City limits. The Commission requested that staff organize a site tour sometime in the next month. Staff will proceed with organizing a meeting time and inviting an RDN staff member to attend.

The information was received as presented.

7. Ongoing Business

a) Heritage Tax Exemption Program Assessment – Draft Report

A copy of the draft report was provided to all members prior to the meeting. C. Sholberg explained that the report is in response to the following Council motion that was passed 2013-APR-08:

“That staff prepare a report providing an assessment of the City’s current heritage tax exemption program to ensure it is up to date with current legislative options and to evaluate the processing of these types of applications in terms of equity and efficiency.”

The report contains good background and contextual information on the existing program, alternative mechanisms that can be used, etc. It also clarifies the roles between NCHC and Council when it comes to tax exemption approval.

Committee Comments re: Draft Report

- The Commission currently does not use a specific review method when evaluating the conservation appropriateness of alterations proposed for the heritage building being rehabilitated. Staff currently uses the City's Downtown Heritage Building Design Guidelines, and informally, Parks Canada's "Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada."
- It was recommended that the National Standards and Guidelines be used more formally by the Commission when evaluating building projects and the alterations proposed for these projects. This would allow the Commission to better determine whether or not the alterations proposed by the tax exemption application were supportable by heritage conservation policy as well. This information could then inform the recommendation the Commission provides to Council on whether or not the tax exemption application is supportable.
- It was suggested that Council may wish to create a "Heritage Revitalization Area" for downtown to provide tax exemption support for non-heritage related building rehabilitation projects, particularly where support for general revitalization is considered economically important.

It was moved and seconded that the Nanaimo Community Heritage Commission use Parks Canada's Heritage Standard and Guidelines when evaluating heritage building applications and recommend that Council formally adopt these standards and guidelines as a system for evaluating the supportability of alterations to heritage buildings in the future. The motion was carried.

Further Discussion:

- NCHC's only role is to provide comment on heritage value (not to attach a dollar value).
- The "project" (i.e. proposed alterations and conservation work) needs to be the focus of the evaluation.
- The Commission asked that the "program modification" section be removed from the report. The program should stay in place as it currently is.

It was moved and seconded that the Commission supports the report with the understanding that the existing Heritage Tax Exemption Program parameters not be altered. The motion was carried.

For information, staff distributed a copy of a tax exemption review that was recently undertaken by the City of Victoria which provided recommendations related to the City's Permissive Tax Exemption and Heritage Tax Exemption programs.

b) Heritage Register Update - Additions

At the last meeting, the Commission had asked staff to proceed with undertaking a formal point evaluation of the following buildings, for consideration for addition to the heritage register:

- 469 Milton Street
Using the modified point evaluation system, the building received a failing point evaluation score of 28/100.

C. Meutzner disagrees with the point evaluation because: it is in the only part of old city with half lots; very few with the double pane windows; very few buildings on register from 1890s; considered by general public to be of "heritage"; was a public nomination; and asked that it be re-evaluated. C. Sholberg noted that the point evaluation is a guide, and

the Commission can choose which recommendation they would like to make to Council. The Commission discussed the nomination further and made the following motion:

It was moved and seconded that 469 Milton Street be recommended to Council for addition to the City's Heritage Register. The motion was carried.

C. Sholberg and C. Meutzner will proceed with re-evaluating the building to determine if its point value can be increased.

- 644 Haliburton Street

Using the modified point evaluation system, the building received a passing point evaluation score of 52/100. The Commission discussed the nomination and made the following motion:

It was moved and seconded that 644 Haliburton Street be recommended to Council for addition to the City's Heritage Register. The motion was carried.

2013 Heritage Paint Out/Shoot Out (2013-SEP-15)

It was asked that this item be discussed now while J. Hofman is still in attendance.

The 2013 Heritage Paint Out/Shoot Out will be held on Sunday, 2013-SEP-15 from 10:00 am to 4:00 am. C. Sholberg will be in attendance during the whole event and Commission members were welcomed to attend. Participants will meet at the Nanaimo Museum at 10:00 am to select their building, will have the day to paint or photograph the building, and will meet back at the museum at 3:00 pm for judging. The cruise ship scheduled to arrive that day has been cancelled; however, the event will proceed as planned. More information is available at www.nanaimoartscouncil.ca.

It was moved and seconded that \$500 be allocated to the Nanaimo Arts Council as prize money for the 2013 Heritage Paint Out / Shoot Out. The motion was carried.

J. Hofman left the meeting at 6:15 pm.

c) Heritage Register Update – Possible Removals – Point Re-Evaluations

It was requested at the last meeting that staff proceed with a formal point evaluation for the following properties, and that they be brought back to the Commission for review before being recommended (or not recommended) for removal from the heritage register.

- Woodward / Harrison Residence (215 Newcastle Avenue)

The building received a passing score of 55/100 with original point evaluation; and a failing score of 26/100 with the recent re-evaluation (primarily due to condition). The Commission discussed the building and made the following motion:

It was moved and seconded that the Nanaimo Community Heritage Commission recommends that Council remove the Woodward / Harrison Residence (215 Newcastle Avenue) from the City's Heritage Register. The motion was carried.

- Manson's Store & House (240 Haliburton Street)

The building received a passing score of 72/100 with original point evaluation; and a failing score of 33/100 with the recent re-evaluation (primarily due to condition).

C. Sholberg noted that the City's Bylaw Services and Fire Departments have been observing the structural integrity due to a partial roof collapse and other indicators of structural failure. As a consequence of their review, Bylaw Services is looking to take an order to Council to require demolition of the building. The Commission discussed the building and made the following motion:

It was moved and seconded that the Nanaimo Community Heritage Commission recommends that Council remove the Manson's Store & House (236/240 Haliburton Street) from the City's Heritage Register. The motion was carried.

- d) 2013 Heritage Paint Out / Shoot Out (2013-SEP-15) – Status
Discussed above.

- e) NOCA Building Photo Survey – Project Update
Staff noted that about 80% of the photo survey has been completed with the help of around seven volunteer photographers. It is hoped that the photo survey project will be completed by Christmas; a photo database will be set up with the help of the Nanaimo Community Archives, and added to the City's filing system for future reference. It was suggested that when the project is complete, that the Commission thank the Nanaimo Old City Association (NOCA) and the involved volunteers for their assistance by way of thank you letter, a gift (poster), and public acknowledgement at a future Council meeting.

Staff will make arrangements for the thank you letter and gift (poster). D. Brennan will make arrangements for public acknowledgement.

- f) Entrance Island Lighthouse – Federal Heritage Status Nomination – Status
For information. Staff provided an update to the Commission on the status of the federal nomination for Entrance Island Lighthouse. A historian has been assigned to the project to complete a historical profile. The historian has been in contact with both the City and the Nanaimo Community Archives, seeking information on the national historic importance of the lighthouse. C. Meutzner is currently putting some information together for the request but has been having a difficult time defining the lighthouses' national historic importance. More information will be provided to members as it becomes available.

- g) Heritage Façade Grant Program – Financial Need Issue
The Commission discussed recent concerns expressed by Council and in the newspaper regarding the Heritage Façade Grant Program and the recent grant provided to St. Paul's Church for its roof repair and replacement project. The general consensus was that the grant program is sound but that public and Council understanding of the goals and objectives of the program could be improved. It was also noted that program is perhaps an unwarranted victim of higher level concerns by the public about fiscal constraint currently being directed toward Council.

8. Committee Reports

- a) Snuneymuxw First Nation:
G. Manson was not in attendance. C. Sholberg noted that G. Manson recently retired from her SFN duties. Staff will be looking at whether or not a new Commission appointment is desired by SFN.
- b) Nanaimo Community Archives Society:
C. Meutzner had no report.
- c) Nanaimo District and Museum:
J. Manning was not in attendance.
- d) Design Advisory Panel:
C. Riches was not in attendance.

9. Next Meeting

The next meeting is scheduled for 2013-OCT-02 at 5:00 pm in the Board Room of the Service and Resource Centre (411 Dunsmuir Street).

10. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 6:42 pm.

APPROVED

Chair

Date